In first-millenium Peru, Moche artisans produced hundreds of thousands of fine ceramic effigies, some of which show sex acts and sex organs in startlingly explicit detail. Researchers including American ‘sexologist’ Alfred Kinsey and Peruvian archaeologist Rafael Larco Hoyle have tried to solve the mystery of these ancient artifacts, which do not seem to show actual sexual reproduction. Cross-cultural ethnographic and historical research demonstrates that this puzzle may be more apparent than real: the problem is not in the past, but in the present, when ‘common sense’ leads us to mistaken assumptions about what constitutes a reproductive act.